

# On the size of graphs without repeated cycle lengths<sup>\*</sup>

Chunhui Lai<sup>a,1</sup>

<sup>a</sup>*School of Mathematics and Statistics,  
Minnan Normal University, Zhangzhou, Fujian, P.R. China.*

---

## Abstract

In 1975, P. Erdős proposed the problem of determining the maximum number  $f(n)$  of edges in a graph with  $n$  vertices in which any two cycles are of different lengths. In this paper, it is proved that

$$f(n) \geq n + \frac{107}{3}t + \frac{7}{3}$$

for  $t = 1260r + 169$  ( $r \geq 1$ ) and  $n \geq \frac{2119}{4}t^2 + 87978t + \frac{15957}{4}$ . Consequently,  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n)-n}{\sqrt{n}} \geq \sqrt{2 + \frac{7654}{19071}}$ , which is better than the previous bounds  $\sqrt{2}$  [Y. Shi, Discrete Math. 71(1988), 57-71],  $\sqrt{2.4}$  [C. Lai, Australas. J. Combin. 27(2003), 101-105]. The conjecture  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n)-n}{\sqrt{n}} = \sqrt{2.4}$  is not true.

*Key words:* Graph, cycle, number of edges.

*AMS 2000 MSC:* 05C38, 05C35.

---

## 1 Introduction

Let  $f(n)$  be the maximum number of edges in a graph on  $n$  vertices in which no two cycles have the same length. In 1975, Erdős raised the problem of

---

\* Project supported by the National Science Foundation of China(Nos.11401290,61379021), NSF of Fujian(Nos.2015J01018, 2014J01020, 2016J01027, 2016J01673 ), Fujian Provincial Training Foundation for "Bai-Quan-Wan Talents Engineering", Project of Fujian Education Department(Nos.JA15295, JZ160455).

Email address: laich2011@msn.cn; laichunhui@mnnu.edu.cn (Chunhui Lai).

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding author

determining  $f(n)$  (see Bondy and Murty [1], p.247, Problem 11). Shi [15] proved a lower bound.

**Theorem 1 (Shi [15])**

$$f(n) \geq n + [(\sqrt{8n - 23} + 1)/2]$$

for  $n \geq 3$ .

Chen, Lehel, Jacobson, and Shreve [3], Jia [5], Lai [6–8], Shi [16,18–20] obtained some additional related results.

Boros, Caro, Füredi and Yuster [2] proved an upper bound.

**Theorem 2 (Boros, Caro, Füredi and Yuster [2])** For  $n$  sufficiently large,

$$f(n) < n + 1.98\sqrt{n}.$$

Lai [9] improved the lower bound.

**Theorem 3 (Lai [9])**

$$f(n) \geq n + \sqrt{2.4}\sqrt{n}(1 - o(1))$$

Lai [6,9] proposed the following conjectures:

**Conjecture 4 (Lai [9])**

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n) - n}{\sqrt{n}} = \sqrt{2.4}.$$

**Conjecture 5 (Lai [6] )**

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n) - n}{\sqrt{n}} \leq \sqrt{3}.$$

Markström [13] raised the following problem:

**Problem 6 (Markström [13])** Determine the maximum number of edges in a hamiltonian graph on  $n$  vertices with no repeated cycle lengths.

Results for the maximum number of edges in a 2-connected graph on  $n$  vertices in which no two cycles have the same length can be found in [2,3,15].

Survey articles on this problem can be found in Tian [21], Zhang [24], Lai and Liu [10].

The progress of all 50 problems in [1] can be find in Locke [12].

A related topic concerns the Entringer problem, which is to determine which simple graphs have exactly one cycle of each length  $l$ ,  $3 \leq l \leq v$  (see problem 10 in [1]). This problem was posed in 1973 by R. C. Entringer. For developments on this topic, see [4,11,13,14,17,22,23].

In this paper, we construct a graph  $G$  having no two cycles with the same length which leads to the following result.

**Theorem 7** Let  $t = 1260r + 169$  ( $r \geq 1$ ), then

$$f(n) \geq n + \frac{107}{3}t + \frac{7}{3}$$

for  $n \geq \frac{2119}{4}t^2 + 87978t + \frac{15957}{4}$ .

Hence conjecture 4 is not true.

## 2 Proof of theorem 7

**Proof.** Let  $t = 1260r + 169$ ,  $r \geq 1$ ,  $n_t = \frac{2119}{4}t^2 + 87978t + \frac{15957}{4}$ ,  $n \geq n_t$ . We shall show that there exists a graph  $G$  on  $n$  vertices with  $n + \frac{107}{3}t + \frac{7}{3}$  edges such that all cycles in  $G$  have distinct lengths.

Now we construct the graph  $G$  which consists of a number of subgraphs:  $B_i$ ,  $(0 \leq i \leq 20t, 27t \leq i \leq 28t + 64, 29t - 734 \leq i \leq 29t + 267, 30t - 531 \leq i \leq 30t + 57, 31t - 741 \leq i \leq 31t + 58, 32t - 740 \leq i \leq 32t + 57, 33t - 741 \leq i \leq 33t + 57, 34t - 741 \leq i \leq 34t + 52, 35t - 746 \leq i \leq 35t + 60, 36t - 738 \leq i \leq 36t + 60, 37t - 738 \leq i \leq 37t + 799, i = 20t + j (1 \leq j \leq \frac{t-7}{6}), i = 20t + \frac{t-1}{6} + j (1 \leq j \leq \frac{t-7}{6}), i = 21t + 2j + 1 (0 \leq j \leq t-1), i = 21t + 2j (0 \leq j \leq \frac{t-1}{2}), i = 23t + 2j + 1 (0 \leq j \leq \frac{t-1}{2}), \text{ and } i = 20t + \frac{t-1}{6}, i = 20t + \frac{t-1}{3} + \frac{t-1}{6} - 1, i = 20t + \frac{t-1}{3} + \frac{t-1}{6}, i = 20t + \frac{2t-2}{3}, i = 21t - 2, i = 21t - 1, i = 26t)$ .

Now we define these  $B_i$ s. These subgraphs all only have a common vertex  $x$ , otherwise their vertex sets are pairwise disjoint.

For  $1 \leq i \leq \frac{t-7}{6}$ , let the subgraph  $B_{20t+i}$  consists of a cycle

$$xa_i^1a_i^2\dots a_i^{\frac{62t-8}{3}+2i}x$$

and a path:

$$xa_{i,1}^1a_{i,1}^2\dots a_{i,1}^{\frac{59t-5}{6}}a_i^{\frac{61t-1}{6}+i}$$

Based the construction,  $B_{20t+i}$  contains exactly three cycles of lengths:

$$20t+i, 20t+\frac{t-1}{3}+i-1, 20t+\frac{2t-2}{3}+2i-1.$$

For  $1 \leq i \leq \frac{t-7}{6}$ , let the subgraph  $B_{20t+\frac{t-1}{6}+i}$  consists of a cycle

$$xb_i^1b_i^2\dots b_i^{\frac{62t-5}{3}+2i}x$$

and a path:

$$xb_{i,1}^1b_{i,1}^2\dots b_{i,1}^{10t-1}b_i^{\frac{61t-1}{6}+i}$$

Based the construction,  $B_{20t+\frac{t-1}{6}+i}$  contains exactly three cycles of lengths:

$$20t+\frac{t-1}{6}+i, 20t+\frac{t-1}{3}+\frac{t-1}{6}+i, 20t+\frac{2t-2}{3}+2i.$$

For  $0 \leq i \leq t-1$ , let the subgraph  $B_{21t+2i+1}$  consists of a cycle

$$xu_i^1u_i^2\dots u_i^{25t+2i-1}x$$

and a path:

$$xu_{i,1}^1u_{i,1}^2\dots u_{i,1}^{(19t+2i-1)/2}u_i^{(23t+2i+1)/2}$$

Based the construction,  $B_{21t+2i+1}$  contains exactly three cycles of lengths:

$$21t+2i+1, 23t+2i, 25t+2i.$$

For  $0 \leq i \leq \frac{t-3}{2}$ , let the subgraph  $B_{21t+2i}$  consists of a cycle

$$xv_i^1v_i^2\dots v_i^{25t+2i}x$$

and a path:

$$xv_{i,1}^1v_{i,1}^2\dots v_{i,1}^{9t+i-1}v_i^{12t+i}$$

Based the construction,  $B_{21t+2i}$  contains exactly three cycles of lengths:

$$21t + 2i, 22t + 2i + 1, 25t + 2i + 1.$$

For  $i = \frac{t-1}{2}$ ,  $B_{21t+2i}$  is simply a cycle of length  $22t - 1$ .

For  $0 \leq i \leq \frac{t-3}{2}$ , let the subgraph  $B_{23t+2i+1}$  consists of a cycle

$$xw_i^1 w_i^2 \dots w_i^{26t+2i+1} x$$

and a path:

$$xw_{i,1}^1 w_{i,1}^2 \dots w_{i,1}^{(21t+2i-1)/2} w_i^{(25t+2i+1)/2}$$

Based the construction,  $B_{23t+2i+1}$  contains exactly three cycles of lengths:

$$23t + 2i + 1, 24t + 2i + 2, 26t + 2i + 2.$$

For  $i = \frac{t-1}{2}$ ,  $B_{23t+2i+1}$  is simply a cycle of length  $24t$ .

For  $58 \leq i \leq t - 742$ , let the subgraph  $B_{27t+i-57}$  consists of a cycle

$$C_{27t+i-57} = xy_i^1 y_i^2 \dots y_i^{132t+11i+893} x$$

and ten paths sharing a common vertex  $x$ , the other end vertices are on the cycle  $C_{27t+i-57}$ :

$$\begin{aligned} & xy_{i,1}^1 y_{i,1}^2 \dots y_{i,1}^{(17t-1)/2} y_i^{(37t-115)/2+i} \\ & xy_{i,2}^1 y_{i,2}^2 \dots y_{i,2}^{(19t-1)/2} y_i^{(57t-103)/2+2i} \\ & xy_{i,3}^1 y_{i,3}^2 \dots y_{i,3}^{(19t-1)/2} y_i^{(77t+315)/2+3i} \\ & xy_{i,4}^1 y_{i,4}^2 \dots y_{i,4}^{(21t-1)/2} y_i^{(97t+313)/2+4i} \\ & xy_{i,5}^1 y_{i,5}^2 \dots y_{i,5}^{(21t-1)/2} y_i^{(117t+313)/2+5i} \\ & xy_{i,6}^1 y_{i,6}^2 \dots y_{i,6}^{(23t-1)/2} y_i^{(137t+311)/2+6i} \\ & xy_{i,7}^1 y_{i,7}^2 \dots y_{i,7}^{(23t-1)/2} y_i^{(157t+309)/2+7i} \\ & xy_{i,8}^1 y_{i,8}^2 \dots y_{i,8}^{(25t-1)/2} y_i^{(177t+297)/2+8i} \\ & xy_{i,9}^1 y_{i,9}^2 \dots y_{i,9}^{(25t-1)/2} y_i^{(197t+301)/2+9i} \\ & xy_{i,10}^1 y_{i,10}^2 \dots y_{i,10}^{(27t-1)/2} y_i^{(217t+305)/2+10i}. \end{aligned}$$

As a cycle with  $d$  chords contains  $\binom{d+2}{2}$  distinct cycles,  $B_{27t+i-57}$  contains exactly 66 cycles of lengths:

$$\begin{aligned}
27t + i - 57, & \quad 28t + i + 7, & \quad 29t + i + 210, & \quad 30t + i, \\
31t + i + 1, & \quad 32t + i, & \quad 33t + i, & \quad 34t + i - 5, \\
35t + i + 3, & \quad 36t + i + 3, & \quad 37t + i + 742, & \quad 38t + 2i - 51, \\
38t + 2i + 216, & \quad 40t + 2i + 209, & \quad 40t + 2i, & \quad 42t + 2i, \\
42t + 2i - 1, & \quad 44t + 2i - 6, & \quad 44t + 2i - 3, & \quad 46t + 2i + 5, \\
46t + 2i + 744, & \quad 48t + 3i + 158, & \quad 49t + 3i + 215, & \quad 50t + 3i + 209, \\
51t + 3i - 1, & \quad 52t + 3i - 1, & \quad 53t + 3i - 7, & \quad 54t + 3i - 4, \\
55t + 3i - 1, & \quad 56t + 3i + 746, & \quad 59t + 4i + 157, & \quad 59t + 4i + 215, \\
61t + 4i + 208, & \quad 61t + 4i - 2, & \quad 63t + 4i - 7, & \quad 63t + 4i - 5, \\
65t + 4i - 2, & \quad 65t + 4i + 740, & \quad 69t + 5i + 157, & \quad 70t + 5i + 214, \\
71t + 5i + 207, & \quad 72t + 5i - 8, & \quad 73t + 5i - 5, & \quad 74t + 5i - 3, \\
75t + 5i + 739, & \quad 80t + 6i + 156, & \quad 80t + 6i + 213, & \quad 82t + 6i + 201, \\
82t + 6i - 6, & \quad 84t + 6i - 3, & \quad 84t + 6i + 738, & \quad 90t + 7i + 155, \\
91t + 7i + 207, & \quad 92t + 7i + 203, & \quad 93t + 7i - 4, & \quad 94t + 7i + 738, \\
101t + 8i + 149, & \quad 101t + 8i + 209, & \quad 103t + 8i + 205, & \quad 103t + 8i + 737, \\
111t + 9i + 151, & \quad 112t + 9i + 211, & \quad 113t + 9i + 946, & \quad 122t + 10i + 153, \\
122t + 10i + 952, & \quad 132t + 11i + 894.
\end{aligned}$$

$B_0$  is a path with an end vertex  $x$  and length  $n - n_t$ . Other  $B_i$  is simply a cycle of length  $i$ .

Then  $f(n) \geq n + \frac{107}{3}t + \frac{7}{3}$ , for  $n \geq n_t$ . This completes the proof.

From Theorem 7, we have

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n) - n}{\sqrt{n}} \geq \sqrt{2 + \frac{7654}{19071}},$$

which is better than the previous bounds  $\sqrt{2}$  (see [15]),  $\sqrt{2 + \frac{2}{5}}$  (see [9]).

So Conjecture 4 is not true.

Combining this with Boros, Caro, Füredi and Yuster's upper bound, namely

Theorem 2, we get

$$1.98 \geq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n) - n}{\sqrt{n}} \geq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(n) - n}{\sqrt{n}} \geq \sqrt{2 + \frac{7654}{19071}}.$$

### 3 Acknowledgment

The author would like to thank the referees for their many valuable comments and suggestions.

### References

- [1] J.A. Bondy and U.S.R. Murty, Graph Theory with Applications (Macmillan, New York, 1976). MR3138588
- [2] E. Boros, Y. Caro, Z. Füredi and R. Yuster, Covering non-uniform hypergraphs, *J. Combin. Theory Ser. B* 82(2001), 270-284. MR1842115 (2002g:05130)
- [3] G. Chen, J. Lehel, M. S. Jacobson and W. E. Shreve, Note on graphs without repeated cycle lengths, *J. Graph Theory* 29(1998), 11-15. MR1633908 (2000d:05059)
- [4] J. C. George, A. Khodkar, W. D. Wallis, Pancyclic and bipancyclic graphs, Springer Briefs in Mathematics, Springer, Cham, 2016. MR3495006
- [5] X. Jia, Some extremal problems on cycle distributed graphs, *Congr. Numer.* 121(1996), 216-222. MR1431994 (97i:05068)
- [6] C. Lai, On the size of graphs with all cycle having distinct length, *Discrete Math.* 122(1993) 363-364. MR1246693 (94i:05048)
- [7] C. Lai, The edges in a graph in which no two cycles have the same length, *J. Zhangzhou Teachers College (Natural Science)* 8(4)(1994), 30-34. MR1336586 (96h:05121)
- [8] C. Lai, A lower bound for the number of edges in a graph containing no two cycles of the same length, *Electron. J. Combin.* 8(2001), N9, 1 - 6. MR1877662 (2002k:05124)
- [9] C. Lai, Graphs without repeated cycle lengths, *Australas. J. Combin.* 27(2003), 101-105. MR1955391 (2003m:05102)
- [10] C. Lai, M. Liu, Some open problems on cycles, *J. Combin. Math. Combin. Comput.* 91(2014), 51-64. MR3287706
- [11] S. Liu, On  $r$ -( $k$ )-pancyclic graphs, *Ars Combin.* accepted.

- [12] S. C. Locke, Unsolved problems: <http://math.fau.edu/locke/Unsolved.htm>
- [13] K. Markstrom, A note on uniquely pancyclic graphs, *Australas. J. Combin.* 44 (2009), 105-110. MR2527003 (2010i:05180)
- [14] Y. Shi, Some theorems of uniquely pancyclic graphs, *Discrete Math.* 59 (1986), no. 1-2, 167–180. MR0837964
- [15] Y. Shi, On maximum cycle-distributed graphs, *Discrete Math.* 71(1988), 57-71. MR0954686 (89i:05169)
- [16] Y. Shi, The number of edges in a maximum graphs with uni-length cycles, *Kexue Tongbao.* 33(10)(1988), 795 - 796.
- [17] Y. Shi, H. P. Yap, S. K. Teo, On uniquely  $r$ -pancyclic graphs, *Graph theory and its applications: East and West* (Jinan, 1986), Ann. New York Acad. Sci. 576(1989),487-499. MR1110849 (93d:05088)
- [18] Y. Shi, Some theorems on simple MCD-graphs, *J. Math. Res. Exposition* 11(4)(1991), 551-554. MR1144956 (92i:05182)
- [19] Y. Shi, The number of edges in a maximum cycle distributed graph, *Discrete Math.* 104(1992), 205-209. MR1172850 (93d:05083)
- [20] Y. Shi, On simple MCD graphs containing a subgraph homomorphic to  $K_4$ , *Discrete Math.* 126(1994), 325-338. MR1264498 (95f:05072)
- [21] F. Tian, The progress on some problems in graph theory, *Qufu Shifan Daxue Xuebao Ziran Kexue Ban.* 1986, no. 2, 30-36. MR0865617
- [22] H. P. Yap, S. K. Teo, On uniquely  $r$ -pancyclic graphs, *Lecture Notes in Math.* 1073(1984), 334-335.
- [23] C. T. Zamfirescu, (2)-pancyclic graphs, *Discrete Appl. Math.* 161(2013), 1128-1136. MR3030597
- [24] K. Zhang, Progress of some problems in graph theory, *J. Math. Res. Exposition* 27(3) (2007), 563-576. MR2349503